University of Notre Dame
Department of Theology

Theology 60884:
The Trinity and Christian Salvation
Summer 2018

Leonard J. DeLorenzo, Ph.D.
McGrath Institute for Church Life
Department of Theology
338 Geddes Hall
(574) 631-2915
ldeloren@nd.edu

126 DeBartolo Hall
July 9–27
M–F, 3:15–5:55 PM

Course Description

A famous 20th Century theologian wrote that, "despite their orthodox confession of the Trinity, Christians are, in their practical life, almost mere 'monotheists'." By implication, this would mean that "in their practical life", Christians are not typically in the habit of actually practicing Christianity, since the Christian faith is irreducibly Trinitarian. No study of the Trinity can be strictly removed from the life of faith, and the life of faith for the Christian is ordered to the Persons of the Trinity. This course therefore pursues the contours and the content of the Christian faith, tracing its developments over the centuries and examining how it is made manifest the Christian life of prayer, liturgy and sacrament, and charity. Since Jesus Christ is at once the revelation of God to man and of man to himself, Christological studies take a central role in our work. In sum, this course equips and challenges students to grapple with the mystery of St. Paul's teaching that, for the Christian, *your life is hidden with Christ in God* (Col. 3:3).

Course Objectives

1. To apprehend the irreducible Trinitarian shape of the Christian faith.
2. To become literate in the grammatical and theological discipline of Trinitarian orthodoxy alongside a familiarity with heretical trespasses.
3. To demonstrate knowledge of the historical and theological development of the Trinitarian doctrine in relation to Scripture, liturgy, prayer, and conciliar disputes.
4. To develop abilities to communicate, teach, and proclaim the Trinity in theological, faith formation, and/or artistic forums.

Course Policies

- *Attendance and Participation*: Students are expected to attend all class sessions, especially due to the intensive nature of this course. The class meets daily for 2 hours and 40 minutes, including a break in the middle of class. A student who is unable to attend a scheduled class meeting (in whole or in part) should notify the instructor in advance, whenever possible.

- *Technology in Class:* Stay focused. Laptops, tablets, mobile phones, and other electronic devices are strongly discouraged in the classroom (including before and after when class is in session). As a graduate level course, this is not an absolute policy, but unless this abstention clearly hinders your own learning, you are requested to refrain from using such devices. If the use of such devices is indeed unavoidable for you, please use the device only for course related matters, which is not expected to necessitate the browsing of Pinterest, Twitter, or ESPN. For some rationale behind this (quasi-)policy, see http://bit.ly/focusedclassroom.

Grading

The grade **A** is reserved for what is considered to be exceptional work on the graduate level; an **A-/B+** means that work is at a level of solid and high quality, a level above what is necessary to complete successfully the requirements for the course; a **B** is good solid work, the average and minimum required (and expected of graduate students) for the successful completion of a graduate-level course; a **B-/C+** is a passing grade for graduate-level study meaning that an assignment was completed but in need of improvement and/or further development or clarification; and a **C**, although a passing grade, indicates some serious problems.

Required Texts

The following texts must be procured
Khaled Anatolios, *Retrieving Nicaea* [ISBN: 978-0801031328]
St. Bonaventure, *The Journey of the Mind to God* [ISBN: 978-0872202009; other editions are ok]
William G. Rusch (ed.), *The Trinitarian Controversy* [ISBN: 978-0800614102]

The remaining "required" texts are (or will be) available on Sakai **[S]**, course e-reserves **[ER]** through the Hesburgh Library http://library.nd.edu/courses, or elsewhere online, as indicated in the "Course Schedule". If possible, texts should be printed out and brought to class on relevant days with your annotations.

* Additional texts are "recommended," as detailed below in "Course Schedule"

Course Requirements

1. **Class Attendance and Participation (5%)**

   The maximum benefit of this course comes from diligent and consistent preparation from all members, leading to focused, attentive participation throughout each of the class sessions. Alongside lectures, the combination of focused, informed questions and contributions to class discussions will enrich our study, whether in full class settings or in smaller discussion groups. (This grade assumes unfailing attendance—special circumstances notwithstanding.)

2. **Online Journal (20%)**

   Each student will keep an online reading journal on Sakai in which substantive observations and questions drawn from the texts are posited. An "observation" may include identifying the thesis of the text, brief outlines of the text's structure, and highlighting key points. "Observations" are <u>not</u> interpretations of the text (i.e., your opinion or feelings about the text). For each text, students must record and submit <u>two</u> observations (each observation may be as brief as a couple lines), plus <u>one</u> follow-up question on the text. Articulating these observations and questions prior to class will help focus each student's thoughts before the lecture and discussion relating to the text. Including <u>page numbers (or section numbers, as appropriate)</u> for reference is important and required. These journal entries should be submitted no later than 2:00pm of each class day, though the earlier the better so others (including the instructor) may benefit from reading your entries. Here is an example of what an entry might look like:

   Text Author, Text Title, Class Date:

   1. Observation #1….
   2. Observation #2…

   Question drawn from text: (Question here)

   Students are entitled to two free "skip days" on the online journal for the course, because God is love.

3. **Reflection paper/essay/homily/retreat talk/lesson plan (35%)**

   Depending on individual interests, students will prepare a written component that "translates" some of the theological material from the course into something that might be incorporated into their own work. Due via Sakai as Word doc or PDF (as appropriate) by <u>2:00pm on Monday, July 23</u>.
   [Name document as follows: Last Name, First Name – Trinity Plan]

4. **Final Essay Exam (40%)**.

   This exam is a synthetic, integrative essay written in response to a provided prompt. It will be written outside of class and submitted electronically via Sakai by <u>11:55pm on Friday, July 27</u>.
   [Word files only, with document name as follows: Last Name, First Name – Trinity Final]

Course Schedule

Monday, July 9
A Matter of Love (Introduction)

REQUIRED READINGS

- St. Thomas Aquinas, *Summa Theologiae* I–II, question 28, articles 1–2, available online at http://www.newadvent.org/summa/2028.htm
- **[ER]** Daniel A. Keating, "Trinity and Salvation: Christian Life as an Existence in the Trinity" in *The Oxford Handbook of the Trinity*, 442–53

RECOMMENDED READINGS/ADDITIONAL RESOURCES

- *Catechism of the Catholic Church*, §§69–78
- **[ER]** Joseph Ratzinger, *Introduction to Christianity* (San Francisco: Ignatius, 2004), part one, ch 5: "Belief in the Triune God," 162–90 (good for any portion of this course
- Joseph Ratzinger, *The God of Jesus Christ*, 2nd edition (San Francisco: Ignatius, 2018)

Tuesday, July 10
Worship and the Trinitarian Concentration of Christian Life

REQUIRED READINGS

- **[ER]** Geoffrey Wainwright. "The Trinity in Liturgy and Preaching" in *The Oxford Handbook of the Trinity*, 457–72
- **[ER]** Gilles Emery, *The Trinity: An Introduction to Catholic Doctrine on the Triune God*, chapter 1 (selection): "Entering into Trinitarian Faith," 1–12
- **[ER]** St. Basil the Great, *On the Holy Spirit* (Yonkers, New York: St. Vladimir's, 2011), chapters 1, 7, 10, 25–27

RECOMMENDED READINGS/ADDITIONAL RESOURCES

- Jean Corbon, *The Wellspring of Worship* (San Francisco: Ignatius, 1988)
- Geoffrey Wainwright, *Doxology: The Praise of God in Worship, Doctrine, and Life* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1980)
- *Catechism of the Catholic Church*, §§305–314

Wednesday, July 11
Christian Prayer as Trinitarian

REQUIRED READINGS

- **[ER]** Francesca Aran Murphy, "The Trinity and Prayer" in *The Oxford Handbook of the Trinity*, 505–18
- **[ER]** Hans Urs von Balthasar, chapter two: "The Possibility of Contemplation" in *Prayer* (San Francisco: Ignatius, 1986), 33–83
- St. Thomas Aquinas, *Summa Theologiae* II–II, question 83, article 2, available online at http://www.newadvent.org/summa/3083.htm#article2

RECOMMENDED READINGS/ADDITIONAL RESOURCES

- St. Thomas Aquinas, *Summa Theologiae* II–II, question 83, articles 1 and 11, available online at http://www.newadvent.org/summa/3083.htm
- **[ER]** Herbert McCabe, "The Trinity and Prayer" and "Prayer," in *God Still Matters* (London: Bloomsbury Academic, 2005), 54–78
- *Catechism of the Catholic Church*, §§2700–2724

Thursday, July 12
The Trinity in the Content, Form, and Canonicity of Scripture

REQUIRED READINGS

- **[ER]** Christopher Seitz, "The Trinity in the Old Testament," in *The Oxford Handbook of the Trinity*, 28–40
- **[ER]** C. Kavin Rowe, "The Trinity in the Letters of St Paul and Hebrews," in *The Oxford Handbook of the Trinity*, 41–54
- **[ER]** Simon Gathercole, "The Trinity in the Synoptic Gospels and Acts," in *The Oxford Handbook of the Trinity*, 55–68
- **[ER]** Ben Witherington III, "The Trinity in Johannine Literature," in *The Oxford Handbook of the Trinity*, 69–79

RECOMMENDED READINGS/ADDITIONAL RESOURCES

- **[ER]** Khaled Anatolios, "The Canonization of Scripture in the Context of Trinitarian Doctrine," in *The Oxford Handbook of the Trinity,* 15–27
- **[ER]** Mark Edwards, "Exegesis and the Early Christian Doctrine of the Trinity," in *The Oxford Handbook of the Trinity*, 80–94
- **[ER]** Walter Kasper, *The God of Jesus Christ* (New York, Herder & Herder, 1984), 116–130, 233–249
- **[ER]** Edmund Hill, *The Mystery of the Trinity* (London: Gregory Chapman, 1985), 11–41
- *Catechism of the Catholic Church*, §§101–141

Friday, July 13
Trinitarian Stirrings in the Ante-Nicene Fathers

REQUIRED READINGS

- **[ER]** Stephen M. Hildebrand, "The Trinity in the Ante-Nicene Fathers," in *The Oxford Handbook of the Trinity*, 95–108
- **[ER]** St. Irenaeus, *Against Heresies*, Book III.16–19

RECOMMENDED READINGS/ADDITIONAL RESOURCES

- "Introduction" to Rusch, *The Trinitarian Controversy*, especially 1–17
- **[ER]** J. N. D. Kelly, *Early Christian Doctrines* (New York: HarperCollins, 1978), part three: "Pre-Nicene Theology," 83–222, especially 83–137
- Cyril Richardson, *Early Christian Fathers* (New York: Touchstone, 1996)
- **[ER]** Jaroslav Pelikan, *The Christian Tradition: A History of the Development of Doctrine, Volume 1– The Emergence of the Catholic Tradition (100–600)* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1971), chapter four: "The Mystery of the Trinity," 172–225

Monday, July 16
Arius, Alexander, and the Trinity at Nicaea

REQUIRED READINGS

- Khaled Anatolios, chapter 2: "Development of Trinitarian Doctrine: A Model and Its Application" in *Retrieving Nicaea*, 33–53 and 79–86 (the remainder of the chapter is recommended but not required)
- Arius, "Letter to Eusebius of Nicomedia" in Rusch, *The Trinitarian Controversy*, 23–24
- Arius, "Letter to Alexander of Alexandria" in Rusch, *The Trinitarian Controversy,* 25–26
- Alexander of Alexandria, "Letter to Alexander of Thessalonica" in Rusch, *The Trinitarian Controversy*, 27–36
- "The Creed of the Synod of Nicaea" in Rusch, *The Trinitarian Controversy*, 41–42

RECOMMENDED READINGS/ADDITIONAL RESOURCES

- Gilles Emery, *The Trinity: An Introduction to Catholic Doctrine on the Triune God*, chapter 3: "The Confessions of Trinitarian Faith," 51–82
- **[ER]** J. N. D. Kelly, *Early Christian Doctrines* (New York: HarperCollins, 1978), chapter nine: "The Nicene Crisis," 223–251
- **[ER]** J. Warren Smith, "The Trinity in the Fourth-Century Fathers," in *The Oxford Handbook on the Trinity*, 109–122

Tuesday, July 17
Athanasius: The Reception and Defense of Nicaean Orthodoxy

REQUIRED READINGS

- Khaled Anatolios, chapter 3: "Anthanasius: The Crucified Lord and Trinitarian Deification" in *Retrieving Nicaea*, 99–156
- **[ER]** St. Athanasius, *Orations Against the Arians,* Book III in Norris, *The Christological Controversy*, 83–101

RECOMMENDED READINGS/ADDITIONAL RESOURCES

- St. Athanasius, *Orations Against the Arians,* Book I in Rusch, *The Trinitarian Controversy*, 55–104, especially 55–69
- St. Athanasius, *De Decritis* (*On the Nicene Council*), available as PDF on **[S]** or online at http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/2809.htm, see especially chapter 3–5.
- St. Athanasius, *On the Incarnation* (Crestwood, New York: St Vladimir, 2002).
- *Catechism of the Catholic Church*, §§127–135

Wednesday, July 18
The Cappadocians: Cementing Orthodoxy with the Unity of Persons in Distinction

REQUIRED READINGS

- **[ER]** Joseph Ratzinger, "Concerning the Notion of Person in Theology," *Communio* 17:439–54 (1990), available as PDF on **Sakai** or online at https://www.communio-icr.com/files/ratzinger17-3.pdf
- St. Gregory of Nyssa, "Concerning We Should Think of Saying That There Are Not Three Gods," in Rusch, *The Trinitarian Controversy*, 117–26

RECOMMENDED READINGS/ADDITIONAL RESOURCES

- St. Basil the Great, *On the Holy Spirit* (Yonkers, New York: St. Vladimir's, 2011), especially chapters 16–18
- **[ER]** Gilles Emery, *The Trinity: An Introduction to Catholic Doctrine on the Triune God*, chapter 4: "Three 'Persons' or 'Hypostases'," 83–110 (highly recommended)
- **[ER]** Rudi A. Te Velde, "The Divine Person(s): Trinity, Person, and Analogous Naming," in *The Oxford Handbook of the Trinity*, 359–70
- **[ER]** Emmanuel Durand, "A Theology of God the Father," in *The Oxford Handbook of the Trinity*, 371–386
- **[ER]** Thomas G. Weinandy, "Trinitarian Christology: The Eternal Son," in *The Oxford Handbook of the Trinity*, 387–99
- **[ER]** Bruce D. Marshall, "The Deep Things of God: Trinitarian Pneumatology," in *The Oxford Handbook of the Trinity*, 400–13
- Khaled Anatolios, chapter 4: "Gregory of Nyssa: The Infinite Perfection of Trinitarian Life," in *Retrieving Nicaea*, 157–240

- Alan Torrance, *Persons in Communion: Trinitarian Description and Human Participation* (Edinburgh: T & T Clark, 1996)
- John D. Zizioulas, *Being as Communion: Studies in Personhood and Church* (New York: St. Vladimir, 1997)
- John D. Zizioulas, *Communion & Otherness: Further Studies in Personhood and the Church* (New York: St. Vladimir, 2007)

Thursday, July 19
Augustine and the Trinitarian Coordinates

REQUIRED READINGS

- Khaled Anatolios, *Retrieving Nicaea*, Chapter 5: "Augustine's *De Trinitate*: Trinitarian Contemplation as Christological Quest," 241–80
- St. Augustine, "Sermon 2 on the New Testament," available on **[S]** or online at http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/160302.htm

RECOMMENDED READINGS/ADDITIONAL RESOURCES

- **[ER]** Khaled Anatolios, "Divine Semiotics and the Way to the Triune God in Augustine's *De Trinitate*" in Andrew B. McGowen, et al. (eds.), *God in Early Christian Thought: Essays in Memory of Lloyd G. Patterson* (Boston: Brill, 2009)
- **[ER]** Khaled Anatolios, "Oppositional Pairs and Christological Synthesis: Rereading Augustine's *De Trinitate*," *Theological Studies* 68 (2007): 231–53
- **[ER]** Lewis Ayers, "Augustine on the Trinity" in *The Oxford Handbook on the Trinity*, 123–37
- **[ER]** John C. Cavadini, "Simplifying Augustine" in John Van Engen (ed.) *Educating People of Faith: Exploring the History of Jewish and Christian Communities* (Grand Rapids, Michigan: Eerdman's, 2004), 63–84
- **[ER]** John C. Cavadini, "The Structure and Intention of Augustine's *De Trinitate*," *Augustinian Studies* 23 (1992): 103–23

Friday, July 20
Bonaventure: The Willingness to be Grasped by Love

REQUIRED READINGS

- St. Bonaventure, *Itinerarium Mentis in Deum* [*The Journey of the Mind to God*], 1–39
- Pope Benedict XVI, "St. Bonaventure and St. Thomas Aquinas: Love Sees Further Than Reason," available online at http://www.ewtn.com/library/papaldoc/b16ChrstChrch109.htm

RECOMMENDED READINGS/ADDITIONAL RESOURCES

- **[ER]** Joseph Wawrykow, "Franciscan and Dominican Trinitarian Theology (Thirteenth Century): Bonaventure and Aquinas" in *The Oxford Handbook of the Trinity*, 182–96

Monday, July 23
Communicating Truth: Practicum on Pedagogy and Homiletics

Special Guest: Prof. Todd Walatka, Asst Chair for Graduate Studies, Dept of Theology
* No Reading Assignment for This Day

Tuesday, July 24
Moving with Charity

REQUIRED READING

- Pope Benedict XVI, *Deus Caritas Est*, available in print or online

Wednesday, July 25
Expressing Beauty

REQUIRED READINGS

- **[ER]** Sarah Coakley, chapter five: "Seeing God: Trinitarian Thought through Iconography" in *God, Sexuality, and the Self: An Essay 'On the Trinity'* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2013), 190–265

RECOMMENDED READINGS/ADDITIONAL RESOURCES

- **[ER]** François Bœspflug, "The Trinity in Christian Visual Arts" in *The Oxford Handbook of the Trinity*, 472–86
- **[ER]** David Brown, "The Trinity in Art," in Stephen T. Davis, Daniel Kendall, SJ, and Gerald O'Collins, SJ, eds., *The Trinity: An Interdisciplinary Symposium on the Trinity* (Oxford University Press, 1999), 329–56.
- Gabriel Bunge, *The Rublev Trinity: The Icon of the Trinity by the Monk-Painter Andrei Rublev* (Crestwood, NY: St. Vladimir's Seminary Press, 2007)
- Leonid Ouspensky, *Theology of the Icon* (2 vols.; Crestwood, NY: St. Vladimir's Seminary Press, 1992)
- **[ER]** Patrick Sherry, "The Holy Spirit in the Trinity," *Spirit and Beauty*: *An Introduction to Theological Aesthetics*, 2nd edition (SCM Press, 2002), 77–99, and "The Holy Spirit, Transfiguration, and Glory," 144–50
- **[ER]** Gesa Thiessen, "Images of the Trinity in Visual Art," in Declan Marmion and Gesa Thiessen, eds., *Trinity and Salvation: Theological, Spiritual, and Aesthetic Perspectives* (Oxford: Peter Lang, 2009), 119–40

Thursday, July 26
Music and the Trinitarian Dimensions of Time and Space

REQUIRED READINGS

- **[ER]** Jeremy S. Begbie, part 1: "Introduction" in *Theology, Music and Time* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2003) 3–28
- Jeremy S. Begbie, "The Trinity and Music" (video), available at https://youtu.be/E021XK7tHlc
- Jeremy S. Begbie, "Theology through the Arts" (video), available at https://youtu.be/UlR3bOsoAdA
- **[ER]** Rowan Williams, "Keeping Time" in *A Ray of Darkness* (Cowley, 1995)

Friday, July 27
Final Exam due by 11:55pm via Sakai (no class meeting)

* Please save exam as Word doc with this title: Last Name, First Name – Trinity Final